

Message

From: Culligan, Kevin [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5AB7EF4A59614FD4B4485668C42818C7-KCULLIGA]
Sent: 1/9/2018 2:44:36 PM
To: Harvey, Reid [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f8ec31caad5048db83f210032847de32-RHARVE02]; Zenick, Elliott [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b2eaa2a560d415fb7c8ce9bb56c7ce5-EZENICK]
CC: Adamantiades, Mikhail [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dbbdce942f9e450cbaa4d327e868bf20-MADAMANT]; Marks, Matthew [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=66cf58c470d84403af7d7dfd7efc8016-Marks, Matthew]; Skinner-Thompson, Jonathan [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=271caec1be3b462e97471ba0f3acfdc2-Skipper-Tho]
Subject: FW: Follow-up on 111(b) and 111(d): Materials in prep for tomorrow's meeting
Attachments: CAA section 111 briefing 1_9_18.pptx

For today's briefing

From: South, Peter
Sent: Monday, January 08, 2018 3:33 PM
To: Koerber, Mike <Koerber.Mike@epa.gov>; Henigin, Mary <Henigin.Mary@epa.gov>; Iglesias, Amber <Iglesias.Amber@epa.gov>; Rush, Alan <Rush.Alan@epa.gov>; Scott, Blanche <scott.blanche@epa.gov>; OAR Briefings <OAR_Briefings@epa.gov>
Cc: Ashley, John <ashley.john@epa.gov>; Conner, Lisa <Conner.Lisa@epa.gov>; Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>; Eck, Janet <Eck.Janet@epa.gov>; Johnson, Tanya <Johnson.Tanya@epa.gov>; McKinney, Voronina <mckinney.voronina@epa.gov>; McLamb, Marguerite <McLamb.Marguerite@epa.gov>; Mills, Kathy <Mills.Kathy@epa.gov>; Morales, Mariel <Morales.Mariel@epa.gov>; Pemberton, Wanda <Pemberton.Wanda@epa.gov>; Srivastava, Ravi <Srivastava.Ravi@epa.gov>; Thompson, Fred <Thompson.Fred@epa.gov>; Tsirigotis, Peter <Tsirigotis.Peter@epa.gov>; Fruh, Steve <Fruh.Steve@epa.gov>; Hutson, Nick <Hutson.Nick@epa.gov>; Swanson, Nicholas <Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov>; Fellner, Christian <Fellner.Christian@epa.gov>; Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>
Subject: Follow-up on 111(b) and 111(d): Materials in prep for tomorrow's meeting

I have attached the briefing materials in prep for tomorrow's section 111(b) and (d) follow-up meeting with Bill.

Please call me or Mike Koerber with any questions relating to this information.

Thank you.

Pete South
OAR/OAQPS/IO
U.S. EPA
office: 919 541-5359
cell: 919 599-7213

Organizer Wehrum, Bill

Sent Fri 12/22/2

Subject Follow-up Briefing Regarding Review of 111(b) and 111(d)

Location WJC-N 5400 + Video with CAQPS + 1 866-293-3188; Participant Code: 202-256-4000

Start time Tue 1/9/2018 4:00 PM All day event

End time Tue 1/9/2018 5:00 PM

To: Wehrum, Bill; Mandy Gunasekara (Gunasekara.Mandy@epa.gov); Harlow, David; Lewis, Josh; Tsigotis, Peter; Koerber, Mike; Fruh, Steve; Culligan, Kevin; Hutson, Nick; Swanson, Nicholas; Fellner, Christian; Dunham, Sarah; Reid Harvey; Schmidt, Lorie; Zenick, Elliott; Skinner-Thompson, Jonathan
Cc: South, Peter; Johnson, Tanya; McKinney, Voronina; Eck, Janet



Wehrum Meeting
Request - follo...

Message

From: Snyder, Carolyn [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=4FAFC36D202F4DE3A925E1DF708EDD9E-SNYDER, CAR]
Sent: 8/8/2018 4:33:03 PM
To: Bryson, Joe [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fddb5d1428e9419bade8027a81d40009-JBRYSO03]
Subject: Re: OMB Call

Thanks for the update

Carolyn Snyder
Director, Climate Protection Partnerships Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
snyder.carolyn@epa.gov
202-343-9616

On Aug 8, 2018, at 11:14 AM, Bryson, Joe <Bryson.Joe@epa.gov> wrote:

Carolyn,

Only somewhat EE-related discussion on OMB call was raised by Amanda Lee. She asked for explanation of how the CPP base case was modeled. Misha explained they used mass-based approach only (not rate-based) and did not represent EE (i.e., did not change the input demand). He added that a side case was done that included EE impacts using a significantly lower demand impact than was used in 2015 per discussion from last fall on the Repeal rule. She did not pursue the EE aspect any further.

Some other interesting tid bits I can share w/ you later.

Thanks,
Joe

Joe Bryson
Climate Protection Partnerships Division
(202) 343-9631

Message

From: Snyder, Carolyn [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=4FAFC36D202F4DE3A925E1DF708EDD9E-SNYDER, CAR]
Sent: 9/27/2017 4:29:21 PM
To: Bryson, Joe [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fddb5d1428e9419bade8027a81d40009-JBRYSO03]
Subject: Fwd: Commitments made in RIA draft

FYI

Carolyn Snyder
Director, Climate Protection Partnerships Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
snyder.carolyn@epa.gov
202-343-9616

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Stenhouse, Jeb" <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>
Date: September 27, 2017 at 12:27:34 PM EDT
To: "Snyder, Carolyn" <Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov>
Cc: "Haeuber, Richard" <Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov>, "Harvey, Reid" <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>, "Gunning, Paul" <Gunning.Paul@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Commitments made in RIA draft

Update from Erich on an RIA workgroup call:

"Dave just proposed that we remove statements regarding any time commitments for additional analysis in the draft RIA that goes to OMB today. The group on the call, including Kevin and Erika, was in agreement."

I don't know what effect that has on the recommendation I passed along below for Rick to write AI. Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Snyder, Carolyn
Sent: Wednesday, September 27, 2017 12:13 PM
To: Stenhouse, Jeb <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>
Cc: Haeuber, Richard <Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov>; Harvey, Reid <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>; Gunning, Paul <Gunning.Paul@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Commitments made in RIA draft

That sounds like a great path forward to me. Thanks.

Carolyn Snyder
Director, Climate Protection Partnerships Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
snyder.carolyn@epa.gov
202-343-9616

On Sep 27, 2017, at 12:01 PM, Stenhouse, Jeb <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov> wrote:

I just spoke (separately) with Kevin Culligan and Dave Evans about this language.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Snyder, Carolyn
Sent: Wednesday, September 27, 2017 11:42 AM
To: Haeuber, Richard <Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov>; Stenhouse, Jeb <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>
Cc: Harvey, Reid <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>; Gunning, Paul <Gunning.Paul@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Commitments made in RIA draft

I agree that it is important to not promise anything that would limit our options for next steps.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Carolyn Snyder
Director, Climate Protection Partnerships Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
snyder.carolyn@epa.gov
202-343-9616

From: Haeuber, Richard
Sent: Wednesday, September 27, 2017 10:53 AM
To: Stenhouse, Jeb <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>
Cc: Harvey, Reid <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>; Gunning, Paul <Gunning.Paul@epa.gov>; Snyder, Carolyn <Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Commitments made in RIA draft

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

On Sep 27, 2017, at 7:24 AM, Stenhouse, Jeb <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov> wrote:

Please let me know if you have any direction regarding this language.

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Eschmann, Erich" <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>
Date: September 27, 2017 at 10:10:09 AM EDT
To: "Stenhouse, Jeb" <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>
Subject: Commitments made in RIA draft

Jeb – Alex just flagged this language for me and I wanted to make sure we're comfortable with it:

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Erich Eschmann
Clean Air Markets Division
U.S. EPA, Office of Air and Radiation

202 343-9128 Phone
202 343-2359 Fax
eschmann.erich@epa.gov

Message

From: Eschmann, Erich [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=8B9183A038DD46BA92F0AC3BD3C4C814-ESCHMANN.ER]
Sent: 9/1/2017 12:31:11 PM
To: Bryson, Joe [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fddb5d1428e9419bade8027a81d40009-JBRYSO03]
Subject: RE: some draft EE language/bullets

These look perfect. Would it also be helpful to add what we were talking about in 2016 AEO to first bullet (if I remember the trend correctly)? Curious if you have thoughts on how to do number 4 – I might have an idea. Not sure if you want to hold that one back from a one-pager for now? Let me know if you want to discuss before the call.

Erich Eschmann
Clean Air Markets Division
U.S. EPA, Office of Air and Radiation

202 343-9128 Phone
202 343-2359 Fax
eschmann.erich@epa.gov

From: Bryson, Joe
Sent: Thursday, August 31, 2017 6:17 PM
To: Eschmann, Erich <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>
Subject: some draft EE language/bullets

Hey Erich,

This is too long/wordy, has a little not obvious nuance that might be worth discussing, and does not include significant caveats that are needed in a couple places. That said, below is some draft EE language/bullets for Path B one-pager to react to. Email or call me before 9:30am Friday if you get a chance. I've shared w/ Carolyn who I expect will have a lot of comments/reactions. Not sure if I'll get a chance to get her input before the 9:30 call.

Thanks,
Joe, 343-9631

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Joe Bryson
US EPA, Climate Protection Partnerships Division
(202) 343-9631

Message

From: Eschmann, Erich [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=8B9183A038DD46BA92F0AC3BD3C4C814-ESCHMANN.ER]
Sent: 9/20/2017 4:39:22 PM
To: Stenhouse, Jeb [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=e8521e7f3aac43adbb52fac73cfb22da-Stenhouse, Jeb]; Snyder, Carolyn [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4fafc36d202f4de3a925e1df708edd9e-Snyder, Car]; Haeuber, Richard [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=169f615923364f2cbd7ddb5f2a34a0a2-RHAEUBER]; Gunning, Paul [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f65040017f05429aa05572f096a50463-PGUNNING]
CC: Bryson, Joe [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fddb5d1428e9419bade8027a81d40009-JBRYSO03]
Subject: FW: OMB Request for Review of Additional CPP Studies
Attachments: additional studies.docx; DRAFT bullet points 092017 11am.docx.msg.docx; addendum.docx; criteria for additional studies cpp review ria 170920 v2.docx; proposal_RIA_2017.docx

Attaching a few draft documents in case they are helpful today:

- 1) "Additional studies" document that responds to OMB's request regarding the inclusion of additional studies
- 2) "Criteria for additional studies" was created by OP today and summarizes the "additional studies" document.
- 3) "Draft bullet points" discussing the use of AEO analysis
- 4) "Addendum" is the current working draft of the document that examines trends over time and EE sensitivities. This is a work in progress and is being distributed later today for wider staff review, and Friday for management review.
- 5) "Proposal RIA 2017" is the current working draft of the updated RIA.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Erich Eschmann
Clean Air Markets Division
U.S. EPA, Office of Air and Radiation

202 343-9128 Phone
202 343-2359 Fax
eschmann.erich@epa.gov

From: Eschmann, Erich
Sent: Tuesday, September 19, 2017 4:52 PM
To: Stenhouse, Jeb <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>; Snyder, Carolyn <Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov>; Haeuber, Richard <Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov>; Gunning, Paul <Gunning.Paul@epa.gov>
Cc: Bryson, Joe <Bryson.Joe@epa.gov>
Subject: OMB Request for Review of Additional CPP Studies

Attaching a first draft of the document

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thank you,

Erich Eschmann
Clean Air Markets Division
U.S. EPA, Office of Air and Radiation

202 343-9128 Phone
202 343-2359 Fax
eschmann.erich@epa.gov

Message

From: Marten, Alex [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BBB5E4745E544893B0AA24FA0167A779-MARTEN, ALEX]
Sent: 9/12/2017 9:25:15 PM
To: Macpherson, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8bbdd3b262a14ab5ae26c5a745337667-Macpherson, Alex]; Bryson, Joe [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fddb5d1428e9419bade8027a81d40009-JBRYSO03]; Eschmann, Erich [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8b9183a038dd46ba92f0ac3bd3c4c814-Eschmann.Erich]; Evans, DavidA [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=876417a7feba454a88b56794c1727651-DEvans08]
Subject: RE: draft email..and question about 2015

I'm good.

--

Alex Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

From: Macpherson, Alex
Sent: Tuesday, September 12, 2017 5:25 PM
To: Bryson, Joe <Bryson.Joe@epa.gov>; Eschmann, Erich <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>; Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: draft email..and question about 2015
Importance: High

Last call...I need to send

From: Macpherson, Alex
Sent: Tuesday, September 12, 2017 3:45 PM
To: Bryson, Joe <Bryson.Joe@epa.gov>; Eschmann, Erich <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>; Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: draft email..and question about 2015

All: See draft below. Edits and suggestions welcome before 4.30 when I plan to deliver email

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thank you very much for the assistance. Please don't hesitate to call me if you have any questions.

Sincerely,
Alex

Alexander Macpherson, PhD
Senior Economist
Office of Air and Radiation
US Environmental Protection Agency
919-541-9770

Message

From: Pat Knight [pknight@synapse-energy.com]
Sent: 7/28/2017 1:56:32 PM
To: Bryson, Joe [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fddb5d1428e9419bade8027a81d40009-JBRYSO03]; Conlin, Beth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=2d2d8e6eaba04da08233b77385757dd2-Conlin, Bethann]
CC: Max Chang [mchang@synapse-energy.com]
Subject: RE: New version of EE tool
Attachments: df-cpp-demand-side-ee (20170728).xism

Joe and Beth,

Attached is a new version of the EE tool. In this version I have done the following:

- Implemented a button that you will need to click any time you change the measure expiration schedule, and wish to recalculate the “CPP Analysis” savings trajectory
- Added a “flat” costs button, so you can easily model a single cost throughout the study period

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I will dig more into the embedded EE savings and the AEO working group later today and early next week.

I’ve also touched base with our analysts who I’ve pulled together to work on the EE journal article. We’d been working on an outline, and it could be helpful to share this with you in case EPA is still interested in helping to fund it. Are you available mid-next week (i.e., Wednesday or Thursday) to chat about this?

Thanks,
Pat

Patrick Knight
Synapse Energy Economics
485 Massachusetts Ave, Suite 2
Cambridge, MA 02139

Direct Line: 617-453-7051
Main Synapse Line: 617-661-3248
Email: pknight@synapse-energy.com

From: Bryson, Joe [mailto:Bryson.Joe@epa.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, July 26, 2017 9:03 AM
To: Pat Knight <pknight@synapse-energy.com>; Conlin, Beth <Conlin.Beth@epa.gov>
Cc: Max Chang <mchang@synapse-energy.com>
Subject: RE: New version of EE tool

Thanks, Pat.

I'll have a little time to review before we talk. Had a good discussion w/ EIA folks yesterday. No big surprises, but understand their methods a little better.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Talk at 2pm. Invite includes call-in info.

Thanks,
Joe

Joe Bryson
US EPA, Climate Protection Partnerships Division
(202) 343-9631

From: Pat Knight [mailto:pknight@synapse-energy.com]
Sent: Wednesday, July 26, 2017 8:48 AM
To: Bryson, Joe <Bryson.Joe@epa.gov>; Conlin, Beth <Conlin.Beth@epa.gov>
Cc: Max Chang <mchang@synapse-energy.com>
Subject: New version of EE tool

Joe and Beth,

In advance of our phone call this afternoon, here is the latest version of the savings tool.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks, and we'll talk to you today at 2PM.
-Pat

Patrick Knight
Synapse Energy Economics
485 Massachusetts Ave, Suite 2
Cambridge, MA 02139

Direct Line: 617-453-7051

Main Synapse Line: 617-661-3248

Email: pknight@synapse-energy.com

Message

From: Bryson, Joe [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=FDDDB5D1428E9419BADE8027A81D40009-JBRYSO03]
Sent: 3/26/2018 6:17:15 PM
To: Snyder, Carolyn [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4fafc36d202f4de3a925e1df708edd9e-Snyder, Car]
Subject: materials for Sarah briefing Weds on CPP & EE

Carolyn,

I wanted to touch base with you on Sarah briefing for Wednesday on CPP & EE.

I've done a short slide deck (~6 slides) as one option. I basically walk thru the #s that Erich provided for the discussion w/ Reid last week by breaking them down into parts.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,
Joe

Joe Bryson
US EPA, Climate Protection Partnerships Division
(202) 343-9631

Message

From: Bryson, Joe [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=FDDB5D1428E9419BADE8027A81D40009-JBRYSO03]
Sent: 7/27/2017 10:33:10 PM
To: Joe BrysonHome [Personal Privacy/Ex. 6]@me.com]
Subject: Fwd: Summary of Interagency Comments under EO12866 for EPA Draft Proposed Rule -- Review of the Clean Power Plan (RIN 2060-AT55)
Attachments: Summary of Interagency Comments Under EO12866_EPA CPP Review NPRM_2060-A....docx; ATT00001.htm

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Snyder, Carolyn" <Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov>
Date: July 27, 2017 at 4:52:24 PM EDT
To: "Bryson, Joe" <Bryson.Joe@epa.gov>
Subject: Fwd: Summary of Interagency Comments under EO12866 for EPA Draft Proposed Rule -- Review of the Clean Power Plan (RIN 2060-AT55)

Carolyn Snyder
Director, Climate Protection Partnerships Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
snyder.carolyn@epa.gov
202-343-9616

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Harvey, Reid" <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>
Date: July 27, 2017 at 3:00:49 PM EDT
To: "Haeuber, Richard" <Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov>, "Stenhouse, Jeb" <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>, "Gunning, Paul" <Gunning.Paul@epa.gov>, "Snyder, Carolyn" <Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Summary of Interagency Comments under EO12866 for EPA Draft Proposed Rule -- Review of the Clean Power Plan (RIN 2060-AT55)

In case you haven't received this yet.

From: Culligan, Kevin
Sent: Thursday, July 27, 2017 2:40 PM
To: Harvey, Reid <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Summary of Interagency Comments under EO12866 for EPA Draft Proposed Rule -- Review of the Clean Power Plan (RIN 2060-AT55)

From: Szabo, Aaron L. EOP/OMB [Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov]
Sent: Thursday, July 27, 2017 12:45 PM
To: Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>
Cc: Bolen, Brittany <bolen.brittany@epa.gov>; Laity, Jim A. EOP/OMB
[Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov]; Dravis, Samantha <dravis.samantha@epa.gov>;
Szabo, Aaron L. EOP/OMB [Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov]; Mancini, Dominic J.
EOP/OMB [Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov]
Subject: Summary of Interagency Comments under EO12866 for EPA Draft Proposed
Rule -- Review of the Clean Power Plan (RIN 2060-AT55)

Attached please find the summary of interagency comments under EO 12866 for the Regulatory Impact Analysis (RIA) for the EPA draft proposed rule entitled, "Review of the Clean Power Plan" (RIN 2060-AT55).

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Aaron L. Szabo
Policy Analyst
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget

[Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov]

Message

From: Bryson, Joe [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=FDDDB5D1428E9419BADE8027A81D40009-JBRYSO03]
Sent: 8/16/2017 3:54:14 PM
To: Eschmann, Erich [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8b9183a038dd46ba92f0ac3bd3c4c814-Eschmann.Er]
Subject: RE: Economic Analyses

EPRI slides on their modeling ... not sure if they have other documentation. Would be a good one to include if available.
http://www.rff.org/files/document/file/160211_CPPModelingForStrategicInsights_Niemeyer_0.pdf

Thanks,
Joe

Joe Bryson
US EPA, Climate Protection Partnerships Division
(202) 343-9631

From: Eschmann, Erich
Sent: Wednesday, August 16, 2017 11:38 AM
To: Bryson, Joe <Bryson.Joe@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Economic Analyses

From: Eschmann, Erich
Sent: Wednesday, August 16, 2017 9:35 AM
To: Stenhouse, Jeb <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>
Subject: Economic Analyses

Jeb,

Here is a list of some recent analyses:

EIA (2017)
<https://www.eia.gov/outlooks/aeo/>

WRI: comparison of various analyses (1/17)
http://www.wri.org/sites/default/files/The_Economic_Impacts_of_the_Clean_Power_Plan.pdf

NERA (11/15)
<http://www.nera.com/publications/archive/2015/energy-and-consumer-impacts-of-epas-clean-power-plan.html>

MJB&A (6/16)
<http://www.mjbradley.com/reports/updated-modeling-analysis-epas-clean-power-plan>

C2ES: comparison of various analyses (9/16)
<https://www.c2es.org/docUploads/insights-comparative-analysis-clean-power-plan-modeling.pdf>

BPC (6/16)

<https://bipartisanpolicy.org/library/clean-power-plan-analysis/>

Nicholas Institute (7/16)

https://nicholasinstitute.duke.edu/sites/default/files/publications/ni_wp_16-07_final.pdf

Rhodium Group (5/16)

http://rhg.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/AssessingCleanPowerPlan_EMI.pdf

NRDC (6/16)

<https://www.nrdc.org/experts/david-doniger/new-nrdc-analysis-electric-sector-track-meet-clean-power-plan>

MISO (7/16)

<https://www.misoenergy.org/Library/Repository/Meeting%20Material/Stakeholder/PAC/2016/20160720/20160720%20PAC%20Item%202a%20Clean%20Power%20Plan%20Study%20Report.pdf>

PJM/MISO (3/17)

<http://www.pjm.com/~media/library/reports-notice/clean-power-plan/20170310-pjm-miso-cpp-case-study.ashx>

PJM (9/16)

<http://www.pjm.com/~media/library/reports-notice/clean-power-plan/20160901-cpp-compliance-assessment.ashx>

Erich Eschmann
Clean Air Markets Division
U.S. EPA, Office of Air and Radiation

202 343-9128 Phone
202 343-2359 Fax
eschmann.erich@epa.gov

Message

From: Bryson, Joe [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=FDDB5D1428E9419BADE8027A81D40009-JBRYSO03]
Sent: 8/16/2017 2:12:41 PM
To: Eschmann, Erich [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8b9183a038dd46ba92f0ac3bd3c4c814-Eschmann.Er]
Subject: Final CPP Analyses

Hey Erich,

Here are what I quickly found from the Google for MISO and PJM analyses. If these are of interest I think we'd want to reach out to contacts there to make sure we are using appropriate, final, up-to-date studies/results. I imagine WECC, ISO-NE, NY-ISO and other regions may have similar analyses.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

PJM Analysis of Final CPP – October 2016 (this is just ppt, the report link doesn't seem to work now?)

https://www.eenews.net/assets/2016/10/13/document_cw_01.pdf

MISO Analysis of Final CPP – July 2016

<https://www.misoenergy.org/Library/Repository/Meeting%20Material/Stakeholder/PAC/2016/20160720/20160720%20PAC%20Item%2002a%20Clean%20Power%20Plan%20Study%20Report.pdf>

Join PJM-MISO Analysis of Final CPP – March 2017

<http://www.pjm.com/~media/library/reports-notice/clean-power-plan/20170310-pjm-miso-cpp-case-study.ashx>

One other group we should look for: RFF analysis of CPP?

Thanks,
Joe

Joe Bryson
US EPA, Climate Protection Partnerships Division
(202) 343-9631

Message

From: Bryson, Joe [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=FDDB5D1428E9419BADE8027A81D40009-JBRYSO03]
Sent: 6/19/2017 2:51:12 PM
To: Ian Hoffman [ihoffman@lbl.gov]; Lisa Schwartz [lcschwartz@lbl.gov]; Chuck Goldman (cagoldman@lbl.gov) [cagoldman@lbl.gov]
Subject: Follow-up to Friday call: links to Final CPP Materials

Hey Gang,

Here are links to "archived" Final CPP documents:

General link:

<https://archive.epa.gov/epa/cleanpowerplan/clean-power-plan-existing-power-plants-regulatory-actions.html>

RIA (Chapter 3 has all the power sector modeling/results, including EE aspects):

<https://archive.epa.gov/epa/cleanpowerplan/clean-power-plan-final-rule-regulatory-impact-analysis.html>

Tech Support docs:

<https://archive.epa.gov/epa/cleanpowerplan/clean-power-plan-final-rule-technical-documents.html>

These are the two key EE ones – DS-EE TSD and associated spreadsheet using 3% discount:

- [Technical Support Document: Demand-side Energy Efficiency \(PDF\)\(105 pp, 1.1 MB, About PDF\)](#)
- [Data File: Demand-Side Energy Efficiency Appendix - Illustrative 3% Scenario \(XLSX\)\(2 MB\)](#)

Thanks for taking time for the call. I'll follow up further on as needed.

Thanks,
Joe

Joe Bryson
US EPA, Climate Protection Partnerships Division
(202) 343-9631

Message

From: Joshua Bankert [JBankert@indecon.com]
Sent: 4/10/2018 8:06:02 PM
To: Fann, Neal [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b040a0d5552c40d3a795855b5845c5b4-NFANN]; Stefani Penn [SPenn@indecon.com]; Chan, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8c2d189c5ca846a4b77b094a4e5b18db-Chan, Eliza]; Meredith Amend [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=user2ce93bb2]; Henry Roman [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=userc094bf11]
CC: Baker, Kirk [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=af890a2a9b7642fca064aa58998b70f2-KBAKER]; Dolwick, Pat [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=76d17174a01f4ed3a33cd1c9b639ffc5-PDOLWIC]
Subject: RE: Comparing CMAQ and AP3 results from the Tier 3 scenario

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Fann, Neal [mailto:Fann.Neal@epa.gov]
Sent: Tuesday, April 10, 2018 15:23
To: Stefani Penn; Chan, Elizabeth; Meredith Amend; Joshua Bankert; Henry Roman
Cc: Baker, Kirk; Dolwick, Pat
Subject: RE: Comparing CMAQ and AP3 results from the Tier 3 scenario

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Stefani Penn [mailto:SPenn@indecon.com]
Sent: Tuesday, April 10, 2018 12:38 PM
To: Chan, Elizabeth <Chan.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Meredith Amend <mamend@indecon.com>; Joshua Bankert <JBankert@indecon.com>; Henry Roman <HRoman@indecon.com>
Cc: Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>; Baker, Kirk <Baker.Kirk@epa.gov>; Dolwick, Pat <Dolwick.Pat@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Comparing CMAQ and AP3 results from the Tier 3 scenario

Hi all,

The attached document contains the preliminary comparison statistics. I will show this and the figures I shared last week on screen during the call so we can look at the values together.

Thanks,
Stef

From: Stefani Penn
Sent: Friday, April 06, 2018 4:22 PM
To: 'Chan, Elizabeth'; Meredith Amend; Joshua Bankert; Henry Roman

Cc: Fann, Neal; Baker, Kirk; Dolwick, Pat

Subject: RE: Comparing CMAQ and AP3 results from the Tier 3 scenario

Hi all,

The updated results are saved on the collaboration site under **AP3 – BenMAP Runs > Updated Results (4.5.2018)** and **CMAQ-BenMAP Policy Scenario Application > Updated Results (4.5.2018)**. **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I was limited in my ability to provide you with both figures or stats results by the end of today, so I opted for figures since those are more likely to generate discussion for our call Tuesday. Please let me know if you have any questions, or would like to see any additional comparisons or details before Tuesday.

Best,
Stef

From: Chan, Elizabeth [<mailto:Chan.Elizabeth@epa.gov>]
Sent: Tuesday, April 03, 2018 4:29 PM
To: Stefani Penn; Meredith Amend; Joshua Bankert; Henry Roman
Cc: Fann, Neal; Baker, Kirk; Dolwick, Pat
Subject: Comparing CMAQ and AP3 results from the Tier 3 scenario

Hello IEC,

As per our conversation earlier this afternoon, attached you will find a PPT with screenshots and the Tableau workbook where the images were created.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,
Elizabeth

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Stefani Penn [<mailto:SPenn@indecon.com>]

Sent: Tuesday, April 03, 2018 2:20 PM

To: Meredith Amend; Fann, Neal; Chan, Elizabeth; Joshua Bankert; Jenkins, Scott; Zawacki, Margaret; Henry Roman;

Davidson, Ken; Baker, Kirk; Dolwick, Pat; Acadia

Subject: Reduced Form Tools Update

When: Tuesday, April 03, 2018 3:00 PM-4:00 PM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).

Where:

Agenda

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

AP3 update

Reduced Form Tools Call (Penn)

Tue, Apr 3, 2018 3:00 PM - 4:00 PM EDT

Please join my meeting from your computer, tablet or smartphone.

<https://global.gotomeeting.com/join/322760877>

You can also dial in using your phone.

United States: +1 (786) 535-3211

Access Code:

First GoToMeeting? Let's do a quick system check: <https://link.gotomeeting.com/system-check>

Message

From: Wayland, Richard [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=D69F0A870909402EBD66847003AA6437-WAYLAND, CHET]
Sent: 4/13/2018 12:34:09 PM
To: Fann, Neal [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b040a0d5552c40d3a795855b5845c5b4-NFANN]; Fox, Tyler [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=021c57f288da44738d9dea325aadad85-TFOX]
CC: Simon, Heather [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=a777b3ab435946d399a5ac22de5de197-Simon, Heather]; Possiel, Norm [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=89e1e9284df646adaf76cc6bd02aceb6-NPOSSIEL]
Subject: RE: Preliminary estimate of CPP replacement foregone benefits

Thanks Neal.

Richard A. "Chet" Wayland | Director | Air Quality Assessment Division - Mail Code C304-02 | Office of Air Quality Planning & Standards | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency | Research Triangle Park, NC 27711 | Desk: 919-541-4603 | Cell: 919-606-0548 |

From: Fann, Neal
Sent: Thursday, April 12, 2018 2:07 PM
To: Fox, Tyler <Fox.Tyler@epa.gov>; Wayland, Richard <Wayland.Richard@epa.gov>
Cc: Simon, Heather <Simon.Heather@epa.gov>; Possiel, Norm <Possiel.Norm@epa.gov>
Subject: Preliminary estimate of CPP replacement foregone benefits

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Fann, Neal
Sent: Wednesday, April 11, 2018 5:14 PM
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Simon, Heather <Simon.Heather@epa.gov>
Cc: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Wayland, Robertj <Wayland.Robertj@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Preliminary estimate of CPP replacement foregone benefits

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

-Neal

From: Keaveny, Brian
Sent: Wednesday, April 11, 2018 4:39 PM
To: Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>; Simon, Heather <Simon.Heather@epa.gov>
Cc: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Wayland, Robertj <Wayland.Robertj@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Preliminary estimate of CPP replacement foregone benefits

Thanks a bunch Neal and Heather! This is helpful and interesting.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Fann, Neal
Sent: Wednesday, April 11, 2018 4:10 PM
To: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Wayland, Robertj <Wayland.Robertj@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>
Cc: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Simon, Heather <Simon.Heather@epa.gov>
Subject: Preliminary estimate of CPP replacement foregone benefits

Hi all,

I wanted to share with you the preliminary estimates of the foregone PM_{2.5} and ozone-related benefits of the CPP replacement policies.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thanks,
Neal

PM_{2.5} & Ozone

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Message

From: Stenhouse, Jeb [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=E8521E7F3AAC43ADBB52FAC73CFB22DA-STENHOUSE, JEB]
Sent: 8/30/2017 5:28:57 PM
To: Harvey, Reid [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f8ec31caad5048db83f210032847de32-RHARVE02]
Subject: FW: Initial observations re: EIA AEO CPP analytics

FYI

From: Stenhouse, Jeb
Sent: Wednesday, August 30, 2017 1:28 PM
To: Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Macpherson, Alex <Macpherson.Alex@epa.gov>; Eschmann, Erich <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>
Cc: Adamantiades, Mikhail <Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov>
Subject: Initial observations re: EIA AEO CPP analytics

Hi Darryl, Brian, Alex, and Erich,

To keep us on the same page going into meetings today, tomorrow, and whenever else with respect to this “alternative approach” examining EIA AEO analyses of the Clean Power Plan, here are my initial observations that may come in handy, Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Jeb

Message

From: Haeuber, Richard [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=169F615923364F2CBD7DDB5F2A34A0A2-RHAEUBER]
Sent: 11/7/2017 3:42:23 PM
To: Harvey, Reid [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f8ec31caad5048db83f210032847de32-RHARVE02]
Subject: Fwd: IPM runs

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "McGartland, Al" <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>
Date: November 6, 2017 at 6:28:15 PM EST
To: "Haeuber, Richard" <Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov>
Cc: "Marten, Alex" <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>, "Evans, DavidA" <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>, "Stenhouse, Jeb" <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: IPM runs

Thanks Rick. It would be good to stay in close contact. Dave and alex will connect with Jeb.

Samantha wants to know where we are with the new analysis. I'm scheduled to meet with her a week from Friday on a wide range of issues and I suspect this will be on the agenda.

Sent from my iPhone

On Nov 6, 2017, at 4:45 PM, Haeuber, Richard <Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov> wrote:

Al,

Sorry it's take a bit for me to get back to you - it's been a jammed day.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I'm happy to talk further as well.

Thanks

Richard Haeuber, Ph.D.
Acting Director, Clean Air Markets Division
Office of Atmospheric Programs
USEPA
202-343-9250

-----Original Message-----

From: McGartland, Al

Sent: Monday, November 06, 2017 11:59 AM

To: Haeuber, Richard <Haeuber.Richard@epa.gov>

Cc: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Evans, DavidA
<Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>; Stenhouse, Jeb <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>

Subject: IPM runs

Hi Rick. We are anxious to see the IPM runs that are available. I heard that both the new baseline and two cpp runs (varying EE) are available.

It is important that we receive the output files quickly. We need to build in what approximately what the new cost numbers will be for our regulatory budget among other things. Can you all send to Dave and Alex.

Thanks.

Sent from my iPhone

Message

From: Harvey, Reid [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=F8EC31CAAD5048DB83F210032847DE32-RHARVE02]
Sent: 4/27/2018 4:04:32 PM
To: Mikhail Adamantiades (Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov) [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dbbdce942f9e450cbaa4d327e868bf20-MADAMANT]
Subject: FW: Thoughts for today's OMB discussion

Not sure why he didn't include you on this...

From: Culligan, Kevin
Sent: Friday, April 27, 2018 11:51 AM
To: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Harvey, Reid <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>
Subject: Thoughts for today's OMB discussion

In an effort to make sure that we are on the same page in today's call (I am pretty sure we are), I wanted to lay out some thoughts in advance of the call:

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Message

From: Harvey, Reid [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=F8EC31CAAD5048DB83F210032847DE32-RHARVE02]
Sent: 3/7/2018 1:52:11 PM
To: Snyder, Carolyn [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4fafc36d202f4de3a925e1df708edd9e-Snyder, Car]
Subject: FW: CPP RIA Questions/Comments
Attachments: cpp replacement ria questions.docx

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Reid

-----Original Message-----

From: Sasser, Erika
Sent: Wednesday, March 07, 2018 8:18 AM
To: Harvey, Reid <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: CPP RIA Questions/Comments

Hi Reid-- can you give me a call this morning, if you get a chance?

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

thanks

-----Original Message-----

From: Weatherhead, Darryl
Sent: Tuesday, March 06, 2018 3:24 PM
To: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: CPP RIA Questions/Comments

Just for you to be aware of their questions.

-----Original Message-----

From: Marten, Alex
Sent: Monday, March 05, 2018 8:15 AM
To: Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Stenhouse, Jeb <Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov>
Cc: Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>; Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>
Subject: CPP RIA Questions/Comments

Hi Darryl and Jeb,

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Alex and Dave

--
Alex Marten
marten.alex@epa.gov

Message

Sent: 6/28/2018 12:31:23 PM
To: Culligan, Kevin [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5ab7ef4a59614fd4b4485668c42818c7-KCULLIGA]; Sasser, Erika [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=477638fe84004800bdfd8e62fe3cafc8-ESASSER]; Weatherhead, Darryl [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4889ece1ce1541a0a053ecc16b4a1131-Weatherhead, Darryl]; Fann, Neal [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b040a0d5552c40d3a795855b5845c5b4-NFANN]
CC: Hutson, Nick [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b7e6dc331d174798a3a269070576d896-Hutson, Nick]; Swanson, Nicholas [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=3a03c53d255d4581acb3cb66f04e5df1-Swanson, Nicholas]
Subject: RE: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

From: Culligan, Kevin
Sent: Wednesday, June 27, 2018 6:09 PM
To: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>
Cc: Hutson, Nick <Hutson.Nick@epa.gov>; Swanson, Nicholas <Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

I suggested edits in two areas:

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Sasser, Erika
Sent: Wednesday, June 27, 2018 5:50 PM
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

Hi Brian—I think the ex sum looks very good. I had a few minor comments (marked as OAQPS/Erika Sasser) but overall I think this looks right on. Good to send forward when you all are ready.

From: Keaveny, Brian [mailto:no-reply@sharepointonline.com]
Sent: Wednesday, June 27, 2018 12:44 PM
To: Sasser, Erika <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>; Culligan, Kevin <Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov>
Cc: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>
Subject: Keaveny, Brian has shared 'ch1 - executive summ'

Hi Erika and Kevin,

Here is a link to the draft 111(d) executive summary ready for your review today.

FYI, there are a couple of limited portions still being edited. In particular, Nick Hutson and I are working on wrapping up section 1.2 today. Please don't feel compelled to read through the unresolved comment bubbles - we'll take care of them.

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thanks,
- Brian

Open ch1 - executive summ.docx

See more related to Keaveny, Brian in Delve.



Get the SharePoint mobile app!



Message

Sent: 7/3/2018 4:29:12 PM
To: Svendsgaard, Dave [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d43d5bfb57654651a3bd6656d7c851e9-DSVENDSG]
Subject: RE: RIA references in CPP NSR section

Sure.

From: Svendsgaard, Dave
Sent: Tuesday, July 03, 2018 12:27 PM
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: RIA references in CPP NSR section

Yep that'll work. Thanks

From: Keaveny, Brian
Sent: Tuesday, July 03, 2018 12:05 PM
To: Svendsgaard, Dave <Svendsgaard.Dave@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: RIA references in CPP NSR section

Hi Dave,

Good question. Unfortunately, I don't know what the RIA title is going to be. It often has to change late in the process for reasons outside of our control.

Could you refer to the "regulatory impact analysis (RIA) for this action" and mention that it is located in the docket for this action?

- Brian

From: Svendsgaard, Dave
Sent: Tuesday, July 03, 2018 11:57 AM
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: RIA references in CPP NSR section

Brian,
If I cite to the RIA, what is the proper title and cite?

Dave

From: Keaveny, Brian
Sent: Friday, June 22, 2018 12:49 PM
To: Adamantiades, Mikhail <Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov>; Svendsgaard, Dave <Svendsgaard.Dave@epa.gov>
Cc: Eschmann, Erich <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: RIA references in CPP NSR section

Hi Dave and Misha,

I would actually suggest

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

- Brian

From: Adamantiades, Mikhail

Sent: Friday, June 22, 2018 12:21 PM

To: Svendsgaard, Dave <Svendsgaard.Dave@epa.gov>

Cc: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Eschmann, Erich <Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: RIA references in CPP NSR section

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Svendsgaard, Dave

Sent: Friday, June 22, 2018 12:16 PM

To: Adamantiades, Mikhail <Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov>

Cc: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>

Subject: RIA references in CPP NSR section

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
OAQPS/AQPD/NSRG (C504-03)
109 T.W. Alexander Drive
Research Triangle Park, NC 27711
Phone (919) 541-2380

Note: Positions or views expressed here do not represent official EPA policy.

Message

Sent: 7/2/2018 2:16:37 PM
To: Ferris, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b284293e1764128af12dce50d0bb696-Ferris, Ann]
CC: Evans, DavidA [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=876417a7feba454a88b56794c1727651-DEvans08]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]
Subject: RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Hi Ann,

Thanks again for your help with the 111(d) RIA chapter on economic and employment impacts.

From: Keaveny, Brian
Sent: Tuesday, May 29, 2018 7:11 PM
To: Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Cc: Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Hi Ann,

Thanks for adding the footnote, and for letting me know.

Thanks,
- Brian

From: Ferris, Ann
Sent: Tuesday, May 29, 2018 2:55 PM
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Cc: Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Keaveny, Brian
Sent: Tuesday, May 22, 2018 8:53 AM
To: Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Cc: Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Ferris, Ann

Sent: Monday, May 21, 2018 12:10 PM

To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>

Cc: Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Keaveny, Brian

Sent: Friday, May 18, 2018 5:07 PM

To: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>

Cc: Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Thanks Alex, I appreciate you crafting updated text on the distribution of costs. I'll take a look at this new text in SharePoint.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,
- Brian

From: Marten, Alex
Sent: Friday, May 18, 2018 10:18 AM
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>
Cc: Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

--
Alex Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

From: Marten, Alex
Sent: Thursday, May 17, 2018 11:18 AM
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>
Cc: Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

--
Alex Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

From: Keaveny, Brian
Sent: Thursday, May 17, 2018 11:16 AM
To: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>
Cc: Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I'm happy to chat if needed. Thanks for your help.

- Brian

From: Marten, Alex
Sent: Thursday, May 17, 2018 10:59 AM
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>; Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>
Cc: Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Alex Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

From: Keaveny, Brian
Sent: Friday, May 11, 2018 3:59 PM
To: Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>
Cc: Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: draft 111(d) RIA chapter - economic and employment impacts

Hi Ann,

I'm reaching out to share the draft *Economic and Employment Impacts* chapter for the 111(d) replacement proposal RIA. I would appreciate your review and suggested edits. Please feel free to make edits in the SharePoint document using Tracked Changes. I'd be happy to chat sometime soon if it would be helpful.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks in advance for your help with this.

- Brian

Brian Keaveny, Economist
Air Economics Group, HEID/OAQPS

U.S. EPA Office of Air and Radiation
MD C439-02, 109 TW Alexander Dr., RTP, NC 27711
Phone: 919-541-5238

Message

Sent: 8/7/2018 2:46:10 PM
To: Weatherhead, Darryl [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4889ece1ce1541a0a053ecc16b4a1131-Weatherhead, Darryl]
Subject: FW: text added to preamble

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Keaveny, Brian
Sent: Tuesday, August 07, 2018 10:37 AM
To: Ashley, Jackie <Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov>
Cc: Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: text added to preamble

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Ashley, Jackie
Sent: Tuesday, August 07, 2018 10:13 AM
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: text added to preamble

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Jackie Ashley - US EPA - Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards - 919-541-7664 – ashley.jackie@epa.gov

From: Keaveny, Brian
Sent: Tuesday, August 07, 2018 10:11 AM
To: Ashley, Jackie <Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: text added to preamble

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Keaveny, Brian
Sent: Tuesday, August 07, 2018 9:38 AM
To: Swanson, Nicholas <Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov>
Subject: text added to preamble

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Brian Keaveny, Economist
Air Economics Group, HEID/OAQPS
U.S. EPA Office of Air and Radiation
MD C439-02, 109 TW Alexander Dr., RTP, NC 27711
Phone: 919-541-5238

Message

From: Keaveny, Brian [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=13AC837699A94966ADB381B8C7C380F9-KEAVENY, BR]
Sent: 9/27/2018 2:59:45 PM
To: Ashley, Jackie [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=01a9a3cadfa14c509d09cdae3498dd43-JASHLEY]
CC: Weatherhead, Darryl [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4889ece1ce1541a0a053ecc16b4a1131-Weatherhead, Darryl]
Subject: RE: Brian - could you fact check?

Hi Jackie,

I think your language is good as it is.

- Brian

-----Original Message-----

From: Ashley, Jackie
Sent: Thursday, September 27, 2018 10:05 AM
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>
Cc: Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Brian - could you fact check?

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Jackie Ashley - US EPA - Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards - 919-541-7664 - ashley.jackie@epa.gov

-----Original Message-----

From: Keaveny, Brian
Sent: Thursday, September 27, 2018 9:23 AM
To: Ashley, Jackie <Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov>
Cc: Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Brian - could you fact check?

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

-----Original Message-----

From: Ashley, Jackie
Sent: Thursday, September 27, 2018 8:59 AM
To: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>
Subject: Brian - could you fact check?

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Jackie Ashley - US EPA - Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards - 919-541-7664 - ashley.jackie@epa.gov

-----Original Message-----

From: Jed Dukett [mailto:jdukett@adirondacklakessurvey.org]
Sent: Friday, September 21, 2018 9:30 AM
To: Ashley, Jackie <Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov>
Cc: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Inquiry about ACE rule

Jackie,

I recently received some information from a group that is concerned about the new ACE rule. Is the following statement true? It seems to directly speak to EPA's work on this ACE rule and figured it was fair to ask.

"The Trump administration recently announced its intention to roll back pollution controls on coal burning power plants by replacing the EPA's Clean Power Plan (CPP) with the Affordable Clean Energy rule. By EPA's own admission, the new proposed rule could lead (per year) to as many as 1,630 premature deaths, 96,000 new cases of exacerbated asthma, 48,000 lost work days and 140,000 lost school days, compared to leaving the CPP in place. "

I am just trying to understand the truth, so I too can answer questions.

Thank You
Jed

James (Jed) Dukett
Program Manager
Adirondack Lakes Survey Corporation
Ray Brook, NY 12977
518-897-1375
www.adirondacklakessurvey.org

> -----Original Message-----

> From: Ashley, Jackie <Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov>
> To: Jed Dukett <jdukett@adirondacklakessurvey.org>
> Cc: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>
> Subject: RE: Inquiry about ACE rule
> Sent: Aug 23 '18 16:14

> Jed -

> As proposed, ACE would rebalance roles and responsibilities and give states the primary authority for determining what emissions controls actually need to be established for power plants within their jurisdictions. For this reason, the analyses are illustrative. However, we note (as you did) that emissions in the power sector have steadily declined in recent years due to a range of factors. EPA projects the ACE rule will continue this trend.

> -Jackie

> -----
> Jackie Ashley - US EPA - Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards
> - 919-541-7664 - ashley.jackie@epa.gov

> -----Original Message-----

> From: Jed Dukett [mailto:jdukett@adirondacklakessurvey.org]
> Sent: Thursday, August 23, 2018 3:31 PM
> To: Ashley, Jackie <Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov>
> Cc: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov>
> Subject: Re: Inquiry about ACE rule

> Jackie,

> Thank you for the quick follow-up. I have been doing acid deposition monitoring for over 25 years in the Adirondack Mountains. We have seen marked recovery in our waters to the point that now we are doing a project that involves restoring brook trout. That is good news! The 1990 CAAA has been a wonderful success, something we should all be proud of.

> So naturally, I am trying to discern what is going on with emissions and this new plan; and of course folks are writing things and asking questions that make me wonder what will happen. We don't want to go backwards.

> If I can ask, and I am not sure if this is an EPA question solely, but could this ACE rule benefit coal emissions should incentives or innovation make its way into making coal competitive in the marketplace?

>
> Thanks Again,
> Jed

>
> James (Jed) Dukett
> Program Manager
> Adirondack Lakes Survey Corporation
> Ray Brook, NY 12977
> 518-897-1354
> www.adirondacklakessurvey.org

> > -----Original Message-----

> > From: Ashley, Jackie <Ashley.Jackie@epa.gov> > To:
> jdukett@adirondacklakessurvey.org >
> <jdukett@adirondacklakessurvey.org>
> > Cc: Keaveny, Brian <Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov> > Subject: Inquiry
> about ACE rule > Sent: Aug 23 '18 14:11 > > > Mr. Dukett - >
> > Thank you for your inquiry about EPA's proposed Affordable Clean >
> Energy rule. I'm happy to try to help.

> >
> > Information about potential impacts of the proposed ACE rule, >
> including changes in power sector emissions of SO2 and NOx, is >
> available in the Regulatory Impact Analysis at >
> https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2018-08/documents/utilities_ria_proposed_ace_2018-08.pdf.
> > In particular, Table 3-7 in the RIA (on page 3-16) provides
> projected > power sector emissions of SO2 and NOx for the base case
> and all > illustrative cases. This table shows that EPA projects
> power sector > SO2 emissions to be less than 1 million tons per year
> for all > years/cases and power sector NOx emissions to be less than
> 0.9 million > tons per year for all years/cases.

> >
> > I hope this information is helpful. If you have additional
> questions > about the RIA, please feel free to contact me or my
> colleague Brian > Keaveny (Keaveny.brian@epa.gov).

> >
> > Thank you,
> > Jackie Ashley

> > -----

> >
> > Jackie Ashley - US EPA - Office of Air Quality Planning and
> Standards > - 919-541-7664 - ashley.jackie@epa.gov > > Hello
> Peter, > > I am trying to understand the new ACE rule and what it
> will do to > National SO2 and NOx emissions. I believe your data
> shows both > pollutants were below 1.5million tons through 2016.
> Under the new ACE > rule, will this level now be exceeded for either
> of these pollutants?

> >
> > Thank You,
> > Jed Dukett

> >
> > James (Jed) Dukett
> > Program Manager

> >
> > Adirondack Lakes Survey Corporation > > Ray Brook, NY 12977 >
> > 518-897-1354 > > www.adirondacklakessurvey.org > >

Message

From: Keaveny, Brian [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=13AC837699A94966ADB381B8C7C380F9-KEAVENY, BR]
Sent: 8/24/2018 9:35:23 PM
To: Thompson, Lisa [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=c4fe265551504398a47a9049eba0aa13-Thompson, L]; Nicholas Swanson (Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov) [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=3a03c53d255d4581acb3cb66f04e5df1-Swanson, Nicholas]
CC: Eschmann, Erich [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8b9183a038dd46ba92f0ac3bd3c4c814-Eschmann.Er]; Adamantiades, Mikhail [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dbbdce942f9e450cbaa4d327e868bf20-MADAMANT]
Subject: RIA-related files to docket - batch #2 of multiple
Attachments: 2 percent HRI at \$50 per kW SSR.XLSX; 4.5 percent HRI at \$50 per kW SSR.XLSX; 4.5 percent HRI at \$100 per kW SSR.XLSX; Base Case (CPP) SSR.XLSX; Base Case (CPP) with EE SSR.XLSX; documentation_v6_propose_ace.pdf; Media and phys item.pdf; needs_v6_proposed_ace_rule.xlsx; No CPP SSR.XLSX

Hi Lisa and Nick,

Attached is batch #2 of RIA-related files for the docket.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thanks,
- Brian

Batch #2

Row #	Name of File	Description	Document Citation or Title
11	Base Case (CPP) SSR.xlsx	This spreadsheet contains modeling results for the lower continental U.S. for each run year.	IPM System Summary Report: Base Case (CPP)
12	2 percent HRI at \$50 per kW SSR.xlsx	This spreadsheet contains modeling results for the lower continental U.S. for each run year.	IPM System Summary Report: Illustrative 2 percent HRI at \$50/kW
13	4.5 percent HRI at \$50 per kW SSR.xlsx	This spreadsheet contains modeling results for the lower continental U.S. for each run year.	IPM System Summary Report: Illustrative 4.5 percent HRI at \$50/kW
14	4.5 percent HRI at \$100 per kW SSR.xlsx	This spreadsheet contains modeling results for the lower continental U.S. for each run year.	IPM System Summary Report: Illustrative 4.5 percent HRI at \$100/kW

15	No CPP SSR.xlsx	This spreadsheet contains modeling results for the lower continental U.S. for each run year.	IPM System Summary Report: Illustrative No CPP
16	Base Case (CPP) with EE SSR.xlsx	This spreadsheet contains modeling results for the lower continental U.S. for each run year.	IPM System Summary Report: Base Case (CPP) with EE
17	needs_v6_proposed_ace_rule.xlsx	The National Electric Energy Data System or "NEEDS" database contains the generation unit records used to construct the "model" plants that represent existing and planned/committed units in EPA modeling applications of IPM. NEEDS includes basic geographic, operating, air emissions, and other data on these generating units.	NEEDS v6 Database for Proposed ACE Rule (rev: 03-12-2018)
18	Media and phys item.pdf	This docket item contains detailed IPM output files for the RIA scenarios. Files included for each scenario are: RPE, RPT, DAT, and overview file.	IPM Run Files
19	documentation_v6_propose_ace.pdf	For the power sector analysis of the proposed ACE Rule, the EPA used an earlier version of the model that is slightly different than the version documented on EPA's Power Sector Modeling Platform v6 using IPM website. This document catalogues the assumptions that differ from those published in the complete EPA Platform v6 documentation, and is applicable to modeling scenarios supporting the proposed ACE rule.	Incremental Documentation for EPA Platform v6 used for the Proposed ACE Rule

Appointment

From: Keaveny, Brian [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=13AC837699A94966ADB381B8C7C380F9-KEAVENY, BR]
Sent: 6/27/2018 9:35:06 PM
To: Keaveny, Brian [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=13ac837699a94966adb381b8c7c380f9-Keaveny, Br]; Hutson, Nick [Hutson.Nick@epa.gov]; Evans, DavidA [Evans.DavidA@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]
Subject: plan for documenting 111(d) scenario assumptions
Location: RTP-OAQPS [Personal Privacy/Ex. 6] HEID/Phone-Line/RTP-OAQPS-BLDG-C (RTP-OAQPS [Personal Privacy/Ex. 6] HEID@epa.gov)
Start: 6/28/2018 7:00:00 PM
End: 6/28/2018 7:30:00 PM
Show Time As: Tentative

Hi Everyone,

This time is for us to touch base briefly and decide **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Nick, I see that your calendar tomorrow looks pretty packed (understandably). Hopefully this time works for you. If not, please propose another time. It'd be really helpful to talk sometime soon so we can make headway on drafting this text for the RIA.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,
- Brian

Message

From: Kopits, Elizabeth [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=36369CD40CCB428BAECCEC8B2BC3B74B-EKOPITS]
Sent: 7/17/2017 8:06:08 PM
To: Shouse, Kate [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b758de97ccf34e8884c4a3752fce4ac5-Cardamone, Kathleen]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]; Newbold, Steve [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=962edb2d8cff4cecafa77768ab652c97-snewbold]; Griffiths, Charles [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b6cf9d6d6dd24f5c825170cddcd13e4c-Griffiths, Charles]; Wolverton, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5f7d06177f3e4b75918323aeaa2cee3f-AWolvert]; Sarofim, Marcus [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=8557a127ac804a9dbb76e8b726eaba09-Sarofim, Marcus]
Subject: RE: FYI - draft of sc-ch4 writeup and numbers
Attachments: draft writeup for scch4 - SN alm ks_ek_CLEAN.docx; draft writeup for scch4 - SN alm ks_ek.docx

Hi All,

Thanks for the great edits and comments all around. Attached is an updated draft – both a tracked changes and a cleaner version. We still need to add in the histogram, and I will do some more QAQC of the numbers tomorrow, but in the meantime please let me know if you have any concerns or see any mistakes in the revisions in the writeup.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks!
Elizabeth

From: Shouse, Kate
Sent: Monday, July 17, 2017 10:49 AM
To: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Newbold, Steve <Newbold.Steve@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>; Sarofim, Marcus <Sarofim.Marcus@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: FYI - draft of sc-ch4 writeup and numbers

Likewise, thanks, Elizabeth, for the draft. I've layered my comments on top of Steve's and Alex's comments.

From: Marten, Alex
Sent: Friday, July 14, 2017 4:57 PM
To: Newbold, Steve <Newbold.Steve@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Shouse, Kate <Shouse.Kate@epa.gov>; Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>; Sarofim, Marcus <Sarofim.Marcus@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: FYI - draft of sc-ch4 writeup and numbers

Thank you Elizabeth for pulling this together. This looks really good! In the attached I only have a few very minor suggestions on top of Steve's.

Per your questions:

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

--
Alex L. Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

From: Newbold, Steve
Sent: Friday, July 14, 2017 3:51 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Shouse, Kate <Shouse.Kate@epa.gov>; Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>; Sarofim, Marcus <Sarofim.Marcus@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: FYI - draft of sc-ch4 writeup and numbers

Hi Elizabeth,

The attached version contains some (mostly minor and mostly editorial) suggested edits.

Steve Newbold
U.S. EPA

National Center for Environmental Economics (NCEE)
EPA West, 4316T, MC 1809T
1200 Pennsylvania Ave NW
Washington, DC 20004
(202) 566-2293

From: Kopits, Elizabeth
Sent: Thursday, July 13, 2017 11:42 PM
To: Marten, Alex; Shouse, Kate; Newbold, Steve; Griffiths, Charles; Wolverton, Ann; Sarofim, Marcus
Subject: FYI - draft of sc-ch4 writeup and numbers

DRAFT DELIBERATIVE

Hi All,

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

If you have strong opinions on any of these issues, please let me know. I'm also happy to set up a time to discuss early next week.

Finally, it goes without saying that this is all draft, deliberative and close hold.

Best,
Elizabeth

Message

From: McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]
Sent: 6/14/2017 3:56:31 PM
To: Ferris, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b284293e1764128af12dce50d0bb696-Ferris, Ann]
CC: Guignet, Dennis [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=e792beff70b642feb8b14bd77566eaca-Guignet, Dennis]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]; Massey, Matt [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=2109aa2ba51d4497b98bd1bbcef98afa-Massey, Matt]; Simpson, David [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=55f0b88e811c455290aa34fc8f7bd491-DSimps05]
Subject: RE: Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

Thanks Ann.

From: Ferris, Ann
Sent: Wednesday, June 14, 2017 11:06 AM
To: McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>
Cc: Guignet, Dennis <Guignet.Dennis@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Massey, Matt <Massey.Matt@epa.gov>; Simpson, David <Simpson.David@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

Hi Al,

I've attached an alternative draft "just in case". It's far too long -- but I couldn't find a shorter version to pull from this morning.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,
Ann

From: McGartland, Al
Sent: Wednesday, June 14, 2017 9:21 AM
To: Ferris, Ann
Cc: Guignet, Dennis; Marten, Alex; Massey, Matt; Simpson, David
Subject: Re: Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 14, 2017, at 8:33 AM, Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov> wrote:

Thanks, Alex and Denny.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,
Ann

From: Guignet, Dennis

Sent: Wednesday, June 14, 2017 8:14 AM

To: Marten, Alex; McGartland, Al; Massey, Matt; Simpson, David; Ferris, Ann

Subject: Re: Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,
Denny
202-566-1573

From: Marten, Alex

Sent: Tuesday, June 13, 2017 10:53 PM

To: McGartland, Al; Massey, Matt; Guignet, Dennis; Simpson, David; Ferris, Ann
Subject: Re: Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

Thanks Al.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Alex Marten
marten.alex@epa.gov

From: McGartland, Al
Sent: Tuesday, June 13, 2017 10:11 PM
To: Massey, Matt; Guignet, Dennis; Simpson, David; Marten, Alex
Subject: Fwd: Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

FYI.

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Dorjets, Vlad EOP/OMB" <Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov>
Date: June 13, 2017 at 9:47:19 PM EDT
To: "McGartland, Al" <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>, "Hewitt, Julie" <Hewitt.Julie@epa.gov>
Cc: "Owens, Nicole" <Owens.Nicole@epa.gov>, "Eisenberg, Mindy" <Eisenberg.Mindy@epa.gov>, "Nickerson, William" <Nickerson.William@epa.gov>, "Laity, Jim A. EOP/OMB" <Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov>, "Thomas, Amanda L. EOP/OMB" <Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 @omb.eop.gov>
Subject: Preliminary OMB Comments on WOTUS EA

Al/Julie,

As discussed on our call earlier today, I want to pass along some comments on the draft EA for your consideration while we continue to have some internal discussion

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Let me know if you have any questions.

Vlad

Message

From: Evans, DavidA [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=876417A7FEBA454A88B56794C1727651-DEVANS08]
Sent: 7/12/2018 5:28:26 PM
To: McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]; Ferris, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b284293e1764128af12dce50d0bb696-Ferris, Ann]; Jenkins, Robin [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=24d256fe39284600871e89c26f9b2613-Jenkins, Robin]; Snyder, Brett [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d518eda60c7140919e3f6e366792e578-Snyder, Brett]; Bowen, Jennifer [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=66a625cf6b314520a04341a37cb0da16-JBowen03]; Thompson, Tammy [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b7cb27541e2b4152a884772302b07a18-Thompson, T]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]
Subject: RE: Items to follow up with Erika on

Al,

I'd also mention that we may have other comments as we get a chance to review parts of the RIA and based on the outcome of ongoing staff discussions.

Dave

From: Evans, DavidA
Sent: Thursday, July 12, 2018 1:20 PM
To: McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>
Cc: Elizabeth Kopits <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>; Jenkins, Robin <Jenkins.Robin@epa.gov>; Brett Snyder <Snyder.Brett@epa.gov>; Jennifer Bowen <Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Thompson, Tammy <thompson.tammy@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: Items to follow up with Erika on

Hi Al,

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Hope this list works for you,

Dave

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Message

From: Evans, DavidA [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=876417A7FEBA454A88B56794C1727651-DEVANS08]
Sent: 7/10/2018 10:22:59 PM
To: McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]; Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]
CC: Thompson, Tammy [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b7cb27541e2b4152a884772302b07a18-Thompson, T]; Snyder, Brett [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d518eda60c7140919e3f6e366792e578-Snyder, Brett]
Subject: Accounting for changes in Upstream Emissions
Attachments: appendix 3a cpp-final-rule-ria.pdf; memo upstream methane changes v1.docx

Al, Alex and Elizabeth,

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Happy to share my spreadsheet once I've cleaned it up a bit.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Let me know if you have any questions,

Dave

Message

From: Evans, DavidA [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=876417A7FEBA454A88B56794C1727651-DEVANS08]
Sent: 6/6/2018 7:24:03 PM
To: McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]
Subject: Will called

Al,

Will called me. He is going to change the sentence to something like:

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Dave

Message

From: Wolverton, Ann [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5F7D06177F3E4B75918323AEAA2CEE3F-AWOLVERT]
Sent: 5/24/2018 7:12:31 PM
To: Ferris, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b284293e1764128af12dce50d0bb696-Ferris, Ann]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]
Subject: RE: Employment effects language

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Ferris, Ann
Sent: Thursday, May 24, 2018 3:06 PM
To: Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Employment effects language

Thanks, Ann.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Please let me know if Al has thoughts, suggestions, etc. and when we can send along to Bill.

Thanks,
Ann

From: Wolverton, Ann
Sent: Thursday, May 24, 2018 2:53 PM
To: Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Employment effects language

I have had a bit more time to reflect on this and I think what I would like to propose is as follows:

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Bill replied that an EA from his office may go to OMB tomorrow. The EA he's working on may go to OMB in a few weeks.

Alex – do we want to run this by AI before sending along to Bill?

Thanks,
Ann

564-3207

From: Wolverton, Ann
Sent: Thursday, May 24, 2018 1:31 PM
To: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Employment effects language

Here are my recommended changes to the additional sentences to broaden them a bit while acknowledging the relevance of the SAB process to labor impacts:

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Marten, Alex
Sent: Thursday, May 24, 2018 1:13 PM
To: Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>
Cc: Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Employment effects language

+ Ann W.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

--
Alex Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

From: Ferris, Ann
Sent: Thursday, May 24, 2018 12:06 PM
To: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Employment effects language

Hi Alex,

Bill Silagi asks how to update the economy-wide SAB language in an employment impact analysis in an EA.

Here's a modified paragraph you helped draft for a recent RIA – would this work? What do you think?

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,
Ann

564-3207

From: Silagi, William
Sent: Thursday, May 24, 2018 9:50 AM
To: Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>
Subject: Employment effects language

Ann,

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Message

From: Griffiths, Charles [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=B6CF9D6D6DD24F5C825170CDDCD13E4C-GRIFFITHS, CHARLES]
Sent: 6/9/2017 8:32:58 PM
To: Ferris, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b284293e1764128af12dce50d0bb696-Ferris, Ann]; Marten, Alex [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=bbb5e4745e544893b0aa24fa0167a779-Marten, Alex]; Dockins, Chris [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=3c8db533f0c847c98d706f1a52b0482b-CDockins]
CC: Bowen, Jennifer [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=66a625cf6b314520a04341a37cb0da16-JBowen03]; Wheeler, William [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=352cbf209a0c460ba54523831138b235-Wheeler, William]; Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]; Wolverton, Ann [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5f7d06177f3e4b75918323aeaa2cee3f-AWolvert]; Klemick, Heather [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=826dccc673744a83b5eaca9f71ece8c0-Klemick, Heather]
Subject: RE: Draft Slides for ARLO Presentation
Attachments: Regulatory Impact Analyses - Basics and Issues (6-9-17).pptx

Enclosed is the latest draft of the ARLO presentation. Chris and I tried to incorporate everyone's concerns but feel free to add additional comments or note where I missed a desired change.

Charles

Charles Griffiths
National Center for Environmental Economics
Room 4334B, WJC West, Mail Code 1809T
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20460
Phone: 202/566-0156 Fax: 202/566-2338
Email: griffiths.charles@epamail.epa.gov

From: Ferris, Ann
Sent: Friday, June 09, 2017 10:46 AM
To: Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>
Cc: Bowen, Jennifer <Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Wheeler, William <Wheeler.William@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>; Klemick, Heather <Klemick.Heather@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Draft Slides for ARLO Presentation

Thanks, Charles.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,
Ann

564-3207

From: Griffiths, Charles

Sent: Friday, June 09, 2017 8:08 AM

To: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>; Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>

Cc: Bowen, Jennifer <Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Wheeler, William <Wheeler.William@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>; Klemick, Heather <Klemick.Heather@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: Draft Slides for ARLO Presentation

Thank you, Alex. Very helpful.

From: Marten, Alex

Sent: Thursday, June 08, 2017 4:42 PM

To: Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>; Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>

Cc: Bowen, Jennifer <Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Wheeler, William <Wheeler.William@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>; Klemick, Heather

<Klemick.Heather@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: Draft Slides for ARLO Presentation

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

--

Alex L. Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

From: Griffiths, Charles

Sent: Thursday, June 08, 2017 4:03 PM

To: Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>; Ferris, Ann <Ferris.Ann@epa.gov>

Cc: Bowen, Jennifer <Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Wheeler, William <Wheeler.William@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Wolverton, Ann <Wolverton.Ann@epa.gov>; Klemick, Heather <Klemick.Heather@epa.gov>

Subject: Draft Slides for ARLO Presentation

Enclosed are the draft slides for the ARLO presentation on RIAs scheduled for next Tuesday, 10-12. These are the questions that they asked us to address

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Message

From: Marten, Alex [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BBB5E4745E544893B0AA24FA0167A779-MARTEN, ALEX]
Sent: 5/21/2018 10:23:12 PM
To: Jenkins, Robin [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=24d256fe39284600871e89c26f9b2613-Jenkins, Robin]
Subject: Re: CPP Replacement Econ Impacts

Thanks Robin. I got held up this afternoon. I will catch up with you tomorrow morning.

--

Alex Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

On May 21, 2018, at 3:01 PM, Jenkins, Robin <Jenkins.Robin@epa.gov> wrote:

Sure Alex. I'm free now or tomorrow morning works too.

Robin

From: Marten, Alex
Sent: Monday, May 21, 2018 2:53 PM
To: Jenkins, Robin <Jenkins.Robin@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: CPP Replacement Econ Impacts

Thanks Robin. If you've got a couple minutes today or tomorrow I'd like to bounce a few ideas off you to see how we could beef up the chapter in response to your suggestions.

--

Alex Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

From: Jenkins, Robin
Sent: Monday, May 21, 2018 2:36 PM
To: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: CPP Replacement Econ Impacts

Hi Alex,

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I added very few minor edits elsewhere.

Thanks,
Robin

Message

From: Marten, Alex [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BBB5E4745E544893B0AA24FA0167A779-MARTEN, ALEX]
Sent: 7/20/2018 3:04:24 PM
To: Snyder, Brett [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d518eda60c7140919e3f6e366792e578-Snyder, Brett]; Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]; McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]
CC: Bowen, Jennifer [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=66a625cf6b314520a04341a37cb0da16-JBowen03]; Levitt, Shelley [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=c8b9621bd69f46be8c0405a920f38566-SLevitt]
Subject: RE: RESPONSE DUE COB JULY 24 - Fact Sheets for Administrator Testimony before EPW on August 1st

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

--
Alex Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

From: Snyder, Brett
Sent: Friday, July 20, 2018 10:57 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>
Cc: Bowen, Jennifer <Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Levitt, Shelley <Levitt.Shelley@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: RESPONSE DUE COB JULY 24 - Fact Sheets for Administrator Testimony before EPW on August 1st

Hi – thanks for confirming the Murray factsheet is current. Might make sense to keep as separate in event there is attention given to the Murray case in questioning?

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Brett

From: Kopits, Elizabeth
Sent: Friday, July 20, 2018 10:40 AM
To: McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Snyder, Brett <Snyder.Brett@epa.gov>
Cc: Bowen, Jennifer <Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov>; Levitt, Shelley <Levitt.Shelley@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: RESPONSE DUE COB JULY 24 - Fact Sheets for Administrator Testimony before EPW on August 1st

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Happy to help as needed, but with regard to the Murray page I can't think of anything new that needs to be added there.

Thanks,

Elizabeth

From: McGartland, Al
Sent: Friday, July 20, 2018 10:30 AM
To: Snyder, Brett; Kopits, Elizabeth
Cc: Bowen, Jennifer; Levitt, Shelley
Subject: Re: RESPONSE DUE COB JULY 24 - Fact Sheets for Administrator Testimony before EPW on August 1st

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Sent from my iPhone

On Jul 20, 2018, at 10:23 AM, Snyder, Brett <Snyder.Brett@epa.gov> wrote:

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Brett

From: Teplitzky, Andy
Sent: Friday, July 20, 2018 10:06 AM
To: Snyder, Brett <Snyder.Brett@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Dalbey, Matthew <Dalbey.Matthew@epa.gov>; Thomas, John V. <Thomas.John@epa.gov>; Pritchard, Eileen <Pritchard.Eileen@epa.gov>; Nickerson, William <Nickerson.William@epa.gov>; Shaw, Nena <Shaw.Nena@epa.gov>; Tomiak, Robert <tomiak.robert@epa.gov>

Cc: Campbell, Jennie <Campbell.Jennie@epa.gov>; Kime, Robin <Kime.Robin@epa.gov>

Subject: RESPONSE DUE COB JULY 24 - Fact Sheets for Administrator Testimony before EPW on August 1st

Greetings everyone. While I don't begin my detail until Monday July 23, I've been asked to move this assignment forward as it requires a quick turnaround. I've attached four Fact Sheets describing resources in four project areas:

- Integrated Environmental Strategies (sectors, community revitalization, OFA-permit streamlining)
- Regulatory/Economic-Management and Analysis (NCEE and maybe ORPM)
- Office of Small and Disadvantaged Business Utilization (ORPM)
- Employment Analysis and the Murray Energy Lawsuit (NCEE?)

We've been asked to review these fact sheets relevant to OP work and to provide comments, if any, by Noon July 25. Please send me your responses no later than COB July 24, so we have the morning of July 25 to finalize. Please insert your comments/revisions in redline-strikeout. For now, please focus on the text; I am confirming the budget numbers with OEAS.

For background, here's the incoming email regarding this exercise. Thanks in advance for your work on this.

BACKGROUND EMAIL:

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thank you and please let me know if you have any questions. If there are no updates to provide, please let me know that as well.

Christina J. Moody
US Environmental Protection Agency
Office of Congressional Affairs & Intergovernmental Relations
Moody.Christina@epa.gov

Andy Teplitzky
U.S EPA, Office of Policy

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Mail Code 1804A, Room 4122B
Washington, DC 20460

Teplitzky.andy@epa.gov
202-566-2947

<fact sheets for OP to revise.pdf>

Message

From: Heninger, Brian [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=6F4118EBAD504477A377E6B4FC4D8BEB-BHENINGE]
Sent: 9/28/2018 9:32:15 PM
To: McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]
CC: Pasurka, Carl [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=0c20aa953b914fa8a512c52182b60a56-CPasurka]
Subject: Material on Request for Reconsideration Process
Attachments: RFR 17002A CIO Updates.docx; RFR Process.pdf

Hi Al,

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

EPA's Information Quality Guidelines *Request for Correction* (RFC) and *Request for Reconsideration* (RFR) Processes

- In 2002, OMB issued guidelines that provide policy and procedural guidance to Federal agencies for ensuring and maximizing the quality, objectivity, utility, and integrity of information disseminated by Federal agencies
- Later that same year, EPA issued its own Information Quality Guidelines (IQG's), which were largely adapted from OMB's guidance. EPA's IQG's provide an administrative mechanism for the public to challenge information disseminated by EPA. These mechanisms are:
 - The Request for Correction (RFC)
 - The Request for Reconsideration (RFR)

Request for Correction: When a requester submits a RFC to EPA, the office who disseminated the information, together with OEI and OGC produce a reply which either makes changes to the disseminated information or denies the request. This decision is also reviewed by OMB before being sent back to the requester. However, if the requester is not satisfied with EPA's response, they can file a Request for Reconsideration (which is a bit like an appeal.) OP does not disseminate very much data or other environmental information, so it is rarely involved in the RFC process.

Request for Reconsideration: However, when a Request for Reconsideration is submitted to EPA, OP always has a role to play. How the agency decides to respond to a RFR is decided by a three person Executive Panel, which is chaired by EPA's Chief Information Officer, which is usually the AA for OEI. The other panel members are the Science Advisor (from ORD) and EPA's Economics Advisor (which EPA's IQG's define as the Associate Administrator for the Office of Policy.) The response is also reviewed by OGC and goes through OMB for clearance before being sent to the requester.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

This RFR is just beginning and a draft memo on the previous RFC and new RFR is available. However, in this case, ORD, which provides the Science Advisor to the Executive Panel is also the "Information Owner" - the office who disseminated the information being challenged. Therefore, a replacement had to be found to fill their position. In this case, OEI choose Betsy Shaw in OAR, who delegated this role to Erika Sasser (Director, OAR/OAQPS.)

Staff in NCEE administer the IQG's for OP, including the RFRs. They can provide a briefing on the details of each RFR prior to a scheduled meeting of the Executive Panel, and are happy to provide additional information upon request.

Optional:

Additional Information on the Executive Panel and text regarding replacement of a panel member from the office who disseminated the information

EPA's *Guidelines for Ensuring and Maximizing the Quality, Objectivity, Utility, and Integrity of Information Disseminated by the Environmental Protection Agency* is what defines the three member Executive Panel (see underlined text below.) The Information Quality Act itself was just a two sentence rider on a spending bill and thus not specific as to how the process is run (it simply states that there should be a process for requesting correction... i.e. agencies should: "establish administrative mechanisms allowing affected persons to seek and obtain correction of information maintained and disseminated by the agency that does not comply with the guidelines ...")

Guidelines for Ensuring and Maximizing the Quality, Objectivity, Utility, and Integrity of Information Disseminated by the Environmental Protection Agency

8.7 How Does EPA Intend to Process Requests for Reconsideration of EPA Decisions?

The Assistant Administrator (AA) or Regional Administrator (RA) information owner presents to an executive panel. The executive panel would be comprised of the Science Advisor/AA for the Office of Research and Development (ORD), Chief Information Officer/AA for OEI, and the Economics Advisor/AA for the Office of Policy, Economics and Innovation (OPEI.) The 3-member executive panel would be chaired by the Chief Information Officer/AA for OEI. When the subject of the RFR originated from a member office, that panel member would be replaced by an alternate AA or RA. While the executive panel is considering an RFR, the decision made on the initial complaint by the information owner office or region remains in effect.

From Appendix:

In order to achieve appropriate consistency of response to affected persons on requests for reconsideration and to ensure that cross-cutting information quality issues are considered across the Agency at a senior level, EPA intends for an executive panel to make the final decisions on all requests for reconsideration.

Link to EPA Guidelines: <https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2017-03/documents/epa-info-quality-guidelines.pdf>

OMB Guidelines: https://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/whitehouse.gov/files/omb/assets/OMB/inforeg/iqg_oct2002.pdf

Brian T. Heninger
Economist, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of the Administrator, Office of Policy
National Center for Environmental Economics
4316M EPA-West
202-566-2270

Message

From: Marks, Matthew [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=66CF58C470D84403AF7D7DFD7EFC8016-MARKS, MATTHEW]
Sent: 2/15/2018 7:43:18 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]; McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]
CC: HertzWu, Sara [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=7a0400db95ae4349a64b5e8babea2077-HertzWu, Sara]; Srinivasan, Gautam [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d69332838210416ba51779b19025f832-GSRINIVA]; Zenick, Elliott [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=1b2eaa2a560d415fb7c8ce9bb56c7ce5-EZENICK]
Subject: RE: For review - EPA's objections/responses to Ameren's supplemental interrogatories
Attachments: Kahal_report_final.pdf; Staudt_report_final.pdf; ENV_ENFORCEMENT-#2722240-v1-Ameren_-_verification_for_supplemental_response_to_rog_5_6.DOCX

Okay great. One other thing we need is a verifier for the responses.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Let me know if this works for you. If so, just sign the attached Word document, scan, and send it back to me. Happy to answer any questions if necessary.

Matt

<https://www.regulations.gov/document?D=EPA-HQ-OAR-2017-0355-0002>

<https://www.regulations.gov/document?D=EPA-HQ-OAR-2017-0355-0030>

From: Kopits, Elizabeth
Sent: Thursday, February 15, 2018 1:01 PM
To: Marks, Matthew <Marks.Matthew@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Srinivasan, Gautam <Srinivasan.Gautam@epa.gov>; Zenick, Elliott <Zenick.Elliott@epa.gov>
Cc: HertzWu, Sara <HertzWu.Sara@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: For review - EPA's objections/responses to Ameren's supplemental interrogatories

Hi Matthew,

I just talked to Al. He is fine with the draft, and Brittany doesn't think she needs to be included but defers to OGC on it.

Thanks,

Elizabeth

From: Marks, Matthew

Sent: Thursday, February 15, 2018 8:58 AM

To: McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Srinivasan, Gautam <Srinivasan.Gautam@epa.gov>; Zenick, Elliott <Zenick.Elliott@epa.gov>

Cc: HertzWu, Sara <HertzWu.Sara@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: For review - EPA's objections/responses to Ameren's supplemental interrogatories

Sending a reminder to provide comments by cob today.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Marks, Matthew

Sent: Tuesday, February 13, 2018 8:22 AM

To: McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; 'Gautam Srinivasan (Srinivasan.Gautam@epa.gov)' <Srinivasan.Gautam@epa.gov>; Zenick, Elliott <Zenick.Elliott@epa.gov>

Cc: HertzWu, Sara <HertzWu.Sara@epa.gov>

Subject: For review - EPA's objections/responses to Ameren's supplemental interrogatories

Hi everyone,

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Matt

Matthew C. Marks
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of General Counsel
Air and Radiation Law Office
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20460
T: 202-564-3276
E: marks.matthew@epa.gov

Message

From: Germann, Sandy [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=02275C87F11648A7B660BA3FA54BEDF6-GERMANN, SANDY]
Sent: 8/20/2018 3:10:12 PM
To: McGartland, Al [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5fe25fc1df634f9798675527e0070429-AMcGartl]
Subject: FW: New Trump power plant plan would release hundreds of millions of tons of CO2 into the air - The Washington Post

Thanks, Al...I'll see if Daisy wants a holding statement prepared.

Sandy Germann
US EPA Office of Policy
202-631-0272
germann.sandy@epa.gov

From: McGartland, Al
Sent: Monday, August 20, 2018 10:58 AM
To: Germann, Sandy <Germann.Sandy@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: New Trump power plant plan would release hundreds of millions of tons of CO2 into the air - The Washington Post

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Sent from my iPhone

On Aug 20, 2018, at 8:57 AM, Germann, Sandy <Germann.Sandy@epa.gov> wrote:

Al, Thanks for the copy on this and the Science Editorial. Do you know the specific topic of the latter?

Sandy Germann
US EPA Office of Policy
202-631-0272
germann.sandy@epa.gov

From: McGartland, Al
Sent: Sunday, August 19, 2018 7:18 PM
To: Letendre, Daisy <letendre.daisy@epa.gov>; Bolen, Brittany <bolen.brittany@epa.gov>; Germann, Sandy <Germann.Sandy@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>
Subject: New Trump power plant plan would release hundreds of millions of tons of CO2 into the air - The Washington Post

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Message

From: McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]
Sent: 9/10/2018 2:50:19 PM
To: Alan Krupnick [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=user732196b2]
Subject: Re: Release and VSL

Thanks. We have not experienced any effort to limit the size of vsl or the use of vsl.

If there was ever a case to limit it — the pm mortality would be the application. And we just did the CPP/ACE rule with out standard VSL treatment.

On Sep 10, 2018, at 10:27 AM, Krupnick, Alan <Krupnick@rff.org> wrote:

Hey, Al. Two things.

First, we are going public today.

Second, I saw Sandy Hoffmann who has some evidence that there is a movement to undermine use of (or the size of) the VSL. News to you?

From: McGartland, Al [<mailto:McGartland.Al@epa.gov>]
Sent: Wednesday, August 29, 2018 5:32 PM
To: Cohen, Dave <DCohen@rff.org>; Sullivan, Daniel <Sullivan@rff.org>; Krupnick, Alan <Krupnick@rff.org>
Subject: These slides are making the rounds at epa.

https://haqast.wiscweb.wisc.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/91/2018/08/2_Sullivan.pdf

Sent from my iPhone

Sent from my iPhone

Message

From: McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]
Sent: 8/25/2017 8:03:00 PM
To: Samantha Dravis (dravis.samantha@epa.gov) [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=ece53f0610054e669d9dffe0b3a842df-Dravis, Sam]
CC: Bolen, Brittany [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=31e872a691114372b5a6a88482a66e48-Bolen, Brit]
Subject: the schedule produced by OAR to complete the CPP RIA
Attachments: draft_interagency_review_response_timeline_082517.docx

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

I do not know if this meets your expectations. I think it provides a way to get this out after proposal but before final. My cell phone is Personal Privacy/Ex. 6 if you want to discuss this. (over the weekend is fine too).

Message

From: McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]
Sent: 2/2/2018 2:06:09 PM
To: Dravis, Samantha [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=ece53f0610054e669d9dffe0b3a842df-Dravis, Sam]
CC: Bolen, Brittany [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=31e872a691114372b5a6a88482a66e48-Bolen, Brit]; Kime, Robin [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=7ef7b76087a6475b80fc984ac2dd4497-RKime]
Subject: Enforcement case in court — discovery is delving into the CPP analysis

Hi. OGC contacted me yesterday. An enforcement action against a power plant in Missouri resulted in a court case - the plaintiff is asking a lot of questions about cpp. They want a list of names of people who worked in the CPP RIA. I can fill you in when I see you.
Sent from my iPhone

Message

From: McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]
Sent: 9/14/2017 3:48:24 PM
To: Kime, Robin [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=7ef7b76087a6475b80fc984ac2dd4497-RKime]
Subject: Fwd: CPP RIA Memo
Attachments: CPP Repeal RIA Update for OMB.docx; ATT00001.htm

Here it is -- just JN case

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Sasser, Erika" <Sasser.Erika@epa.gov>
Date: September 13, 2017 at 5:15:15 PM EDT
To: "McGartland, Al" <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>
Cc: "Marten, Alex" <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>, "Weatherhead, Darryl" <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>, "Wayland, Robertj" <Wayland.Robertj@epa.gov>, "Koerber, Mike" <Koerber.Mike@epa.gov>, "Tsirigotis, Peter" <Tsirigotis.Peter@epa.gov>, "Harvey, Reid" <Harvey.Reid@epa.gov>, "Snyder, Carolyn" <Snyder.Carolyn@epa.gov>
Subject: CPP RIA Memo

Al—

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,
Erika

Message

From: McGartland, AI [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]
Sent: 8/15/2018 5:09:12 PM
To: Bolen, Brittany [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=31e872a691114372b5a6a88482a66e48-Bolen, Brit]
Subject: Cpp RIA — omb review

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Sent from my iPhone

Message

From: McGartland, Al [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]
Sent: 8/14/2018 6:51:19 PM
To: Bolen, Brittany [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=31e872a691114372b5a6a88482a66e48-Bolen, Brit]
Subject: Re: CPP RIA edits

Sure. On it now

Sent from my iPhone

On Aug 14, 2018, at 2:34 PM, Bolen, Brittany <bolen.brittany@epa.gov> wrote:

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: McGartland, Al
Sent: Monday, August 13, 2018 5:32 PM
To: Bolen, Brittany <bolen.brittany@epa.gov>
Subject: CPP RIA edits

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Message

From: McGartland, AI [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5FE25FC1DF634F9798675527E0070429-AMCGARTL]
Sent: 5/15/2017 5:20:50 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]
Subject: FW: what is the percent increase in electricity price due to CPP ? (average for nation)
Attachments: cpp-final-rule-ria.pdf

This is no longer on the web site. Dave sent it to me.

From: Evans, DavidA
Sent: Thursday, May 11, 2017 9:53 AM
To: McGartland, AI <McGartland.AI@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: what is the percent increase in electricity price due to CPP ? (average for nation)

AI,

Here is a summary of the percent changes in electricity prices nationally. See page 3-35 of the RIA, which is attached, if you would like to read the discussion of how they were calculated.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Detailed tables from the RIA follow.

Let me know if you want me to get EIA's projection of the change in electricity price. I'm not sure any outside group provided such information, at least not with some reasonably complete documentation, nationally.

Also, FYI, Alex filled me in on your conversation.

Dave

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: McGartland, Al

Sent: Wednesday, May 10, 2017 2:32 PM

To: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Evans, DavidA <Evans.DavidA@epa.gov>

Subject: what is the percent increase in electricity price due to CPP ? (average for nation)

Message

From: Ragnauth, Shaun [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=13085367E78B4DD49CEF8F4F3CA5BA65-SRAGNAUT]
Sent: 7/12/2018 5:51:15 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=36369cd40ccb428baeccec8b2bc3b74b-EKOPITS]
Subject: RE: draft combined writeup for interim domestic sc-ghgs
Attachments: EO12866 LD CAFE CO2 NHTSA 2127-AL76 EPA PRIA 180710_Redline.pdf

Hi Elizabeth,

I was just sent a copy of the latest version of the RIA Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Shaun

From: Ragnauth, Shaun
Sent: Thursday, July 12, 2018 1:25 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: draft combined writeup for interim domestic sc-ghgs

Hi Elizabeth,

This is fairly straightforward and looks fine to me. I made a couple of minor edits in the attached (Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Thanks,
Shaun

From: Kopits, Elizabeth
Sent: Thursday, July 12, 2018 11:52 AM
To: Ragnauth, Shaun <Ragnauth.Shaun@epa.gov>
Subject: draft combined writeup for interim domestic sc-ghgs

Hi Shaun,

Per our conversation, here's the current draft. Please let me know if I missed anything etc. Happy to discuss any time.

Thanks!

Elizabeth

Message

Sent: 10/4/2018 6:04:11 PM
To: Fann, Neal [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group
(FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b040a0d5552c40d3a795855b5845c5b4-NFANN]
Subject: Question

Question from ALA regarding tables 4-16 and 6-15 in ACE proposal RIA. These both refer to benefits calculated using “alternate method”—these are Krewski spline tables that didn’t get removed in the scramble to get the RIA done, right?

Table 4-16 Forgone Climate Benefits and Ancillary Health Co-Benefits using Alternate Method for Representing PM_{2.5} Benefits at Low Levels, Relative to Base Case (CPP) (billion 2016\$)

Message

From: Keaveny, Brian [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=13AC837699A94966ADB381B8C7C380F9-KEAVENY, BR]
Sent: 6/20/2018 2:31:04 PM
To: Sasser, Erika [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=477638fe84004800bfd8e62fe3cafc8-ESASSER]
CC: Weatherhead, Darryl [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4889ece1ce1541a0a053ecc16b4a1131-Weatherhead, Darryl]
Subject: tables requested
Attachments: tables for Erika on 111(d) RIA results.docx

Hi Erika,

Attached is a document summarizing the costs, benefits, and net benefits. This includes comparisons for just the target pollutant, and also our normal approach for benefits. It also includes results compared to the CPP repeal case. All this should be clear in the table titles and section titles.

Please let me know if you have any questions.

- Brian

Brian Keaveny, Economist
Air Economics Group, HEID/OAQPS
U.S. EPA Office of Air and Radiation
MD C439-02, 109 TW Alexander Dr., RTP, NC 27711
Phone: 919-541-5238